

**NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING
PHOENIX AVIATION ADVISORY BOARD**

Pursuant to A.R.S. Section 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the **PHOENIX AVIATION ADVISORY BOARD**, and to the general public, that the **PHOENIX AVIATION ADVISORY BOARD** will hold a meeting open to the public on **Thursday, November 16, 2023 at 3:00 p.m. located at the City of Phoenix Aviation Department, PAAB Conference Room, 2485 E. Buckeye Road, Phoenix, Arizona 85034, or via WebEx teleconference.**

OPTIONS TO ACCESS THIS MEETING:

- 1. Watch the meeting virtually using the WebEx link provided below.**

<https://cityofphoenix.webex.com/cityofphoenix/j.php?MTID=m5aa1a5614a35f27c7e2901a481303ad6>

Call-in to listen to the meeting, dial 602-666-0783 and Enter Meeting ID 2631 237 1427# Press # again when prompted for attendee ID.

Public Comment: If you wish to provide a written comment or speak at the meeting virtually or by phone, please submit a request to pearl.meza@phoenix.gov no later than 10 a.m. on Thursday, November 16, 2023. The email should include your first and last name, email address, the item number(s) and whether you would like your comment read into the record or if you wish to speak. Those who wish to attend in person may submit a request to speak by completing a speaker card at the registration desk at the beginning of the meeting.

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes, Section 38-431.02B, notice is given that the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board may vote to go into Executive Session, or Sessions, for discussion or consultation, for legal advice with the attorney or attorneys of the public body for any agenda items listed below, as authorized by Arizona Revised Statutes, Section 38-431.03 (A)(3) or for discussion of records and/or information that is exempted by law from public disclosure, as authorized by Arizona Revised Statutes, Section 38-431.03(A)(2). If authorized by a majority vote of the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board, the Executive Session will be held immediately after the vote and will not be open to the public. If a decision is requested, the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board may decide the matter in the public meeting or defer the decision to a later date. The agenda items that may be subject to an Executive Session pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes, Sections 38-431.03 (A) (2) and 38-431.03 (A) (3) are as follows: Items 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, & 10.

One or more board members may participate via teleconference. Agenda items may be taken out of order.

The agenda for the meeting is as follows:

CALL TO ORDER

SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS

1. **Summary of Current Events by the Director of Aviation Services**
2. **Summary of Current Events by the Airline Station Manager**

MINUTES OF MEETING

3. **For Approval or Correction, the Minutes of the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board Meeting on October 19, 2023**

INFORMATION ONLY (ITEM 4)

4. **Phoenix City Code Revisions for Peer-to-Peer Car Sharing**

This report provides the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board information regarding proposed Phoenix City Code revisions for peer-to-peer car sharing.

THIS ITEM IS FOR INFORMATION ONLY.

CONSENT ACTION (ITEM 5 - 6)

5. **Passenger Experience Benchmarking Survey**

This report requests that the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board recommend to the Phoenix City Council to award a contract to KPI North America, LLC for passenger experience surveying.

THIS ITEM IS FOR CONSENT ACTION.

6. **Advertising and Graphic Design Services**

This report requests that the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board recommend to the Phoenix City Council to award a contract to Madden Preprint Media, LLC to provide advertising and graphic design services.

THIS ITEM IS FOR CONSENT ACTION.

DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION (ITEM 7)

7. Airport Custodial & Floor Care Services Contract

This report requests that the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board recommend to the Phoenix City Council to award contracts for Airport Custodial and Floor Care Services at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport, Phoenix Deer Valley Airport, and Phoenix Goodyear Airport.

THIS ITEM IS FOR DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION.

INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION (ITEM 8 – 10)

8. Strategic Plan Update

This report provides the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board an update on the Aviation Department’s strategic planning process.

THIS ITEM IS FOR INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION.

9. Concessions Update

This report provides the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board with an update on concession program activity at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport.

THIS ITEM IS FOR INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION.

10. Triennial Emergency Exercise Update

This report provides the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board with an update on the 2023 Triennial Emergency Exercise at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport.

THIS ITEM IS FOR INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION.

ADVISORY BOARD INFORMATION AND FOLLOW-UP REQUESTS

CALL TO THE PUBLIC

This is the time for the public to comment. Members of the Board may not discuss items that are not specifically identified on the agenda. Therefore, pursuant to A.R.S. Section 38-431.01(H), action taken as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, responding to any criticism, or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later time.

ADJOURNMENT

For further information, please call Pearl Meza, Management Assistant II, Aviation Department at 602-273-3382. For further documentation on this meeting, please visit skyharbor.com.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation, please contact Pearl Meza, Management Assistant II, Aviation Department at 602-273-3382. Or 7-1-1 friendly.

The next Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board meeting is scheduled to take place Thursday, December 21, 2023



**PHOENIX AVIATION ADVISORY BOARD
SUMMARY MINUTES
October 19, 2023
*Meeting held via WebEx***

Board Members Present

Sandra Ferniza – Chairperson
Ruben Alonzo – Vice-Chairperson
Stephanie Cherny
Andrew Cohn
Valencia Fisker
Verma Pastor
Tyler Gonzalez – Ex-Officio
Chad Makovsky – Ex-Officio

Board Members Absent

Ron Price

Staff Present

Abbe Slade	Gary Lovgren	Michael Pluff
Alexandria Van Haren	Heather Shelbrack	Moe Yacut
Andrew Durket	Jana Evans	Nicole Donathan
Bradley Hagen	Jason Gitkin	Pearl Meza
Brett Nadler	Kimberly Whetstone	Paul Berumen
Camilo Henao	Kimberly Pylant	Richard Graham
Carl Cephas	Marshall Kain	Roxann Favors
Carolina Potts	Mary Helen Martinez	Sarah Demory
Chris Baranowski	Matthew Becker	Sean Larkin
Cynthia Lizarraga	Matthew Heil	Shawna Larson
Daver Malik	Michael Hughes	Tom Sawyer
Gabe Nevarez	Michael O’Shaughnessy	Valerie Churchwell
Donald Mayes		

Members of the Public Present

Bryan McCarty	Claude Mattox	Karen Ratliff
James Gordon	Scott Sikel	

CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Ferniza called the meeting to order at **3:02 p.m.**

SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS

1. Summary of Current Events from the Director of Aviation Services

Mr. Makovsky welcomed the board members. He noted that earlier that day, a private jet experienced a brake malfunction while landing. The incident temporarily closed Sky Harbor's south runway and delayed some flights by 30-45 minutes. All passengers and crew on board were safe.

Mr. Makovsky then introduced the board's new Airline Station Manager representative, Mr. Tyler Gonzalez.

Mr. Makovsky also announced a newly-appointed board member, David Shilliday. He added that Mr. Shilliday would be attending the November board meeting.

Mr. Makovsky then reviewed Sky Harbor's passenger traffic for August. Sky Harbor experienced a 3% increase in passenger traffic over August 2022, and 2% decrease from August 2019.

Mr. Makovsky then highlighted air service development, with Lynx Air's second non-stop flight to Toronto. There was an event to celebrate the occasion, attended by City staff, Mayor Gallego and Lynx Air executives.

He continued, discussing Condor Air's service to Germany, and the sustainability initiatives Condor is launching in 2024. They plan on using a new aircraft which is advertised as the "planet's most friendly aircraft." Mr. Makovsky noted that it is the first aircraft to be certified under new global CO2 emission standards.

Mr. Makovsky also shared that Southwest Airlines is reaching historic departure seat numbers out of Phoenix. Not only will they break records in 2023, Southwest is also expecting 2024 a record breaking year for Southwest in the Phoenix market.

Mr. Makovsky then discussed the Aviation Department's monthly job fair. Due to strong attendance throughout the year, the department has decided to continue hosting the event. He relayed attendance and on-the-spot job hire statistics from the last event and shared year-to-date cumulative numbers for 2023.

He then shared that Sky Harbor was the recipient of the Arizona Lodging and Tourism Association's "Arts/Attraction Honoree of the Year" award. He thanked the Aviation team and airport business partners for their hard work in earning the award.

Mr. Makovsky next discussed the grand opening of the Crystals Hall food court at Sky Harbor. Mayor Gallego, Councilwoman Hodge-Washington, PAAB members, and concessionaire executives attended, along with celebrity Chef Bobby Flay.

Mr. Makovsky then shared details from this year's Wings for Autism event. Wings for Autism is intended to help people with autism become more comfortable with flying and it also helps airline employees better understand the needs of passengers with autism.

He continued by discussing the upcoming Triennial Exercise. This exercise will test the airport's emergency plan and identify gaps within the plan. He extended an invitation for board members to attend and observe the exercise.

Mr. Makovsky closed by providing an update on several contracts that had been presented to the board. He said that the City Council had approved the contracts and thanked the board for their work in reviewing the procurements and recommending the contracts for council approval.

2. Summary of Current Events by the Airline Station Manager

Mr. Gonzalez thanked the board and Aviation staff for their warm welcome. He said he would be meeting with other airline station managers prior to the next meeting.

MINUTES OF MEETING

3. For Approval or Correction, the Minutes of the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board Meeting on September 21, 2023

A motion was made by Ms. Fisker seconded by Ms. Pastor that this item be approved.

No public comments.

The motion carried.

INFORMATION ONLY (ITEM 4)

4. Phoenix Goodyear Airport Noise Complaints

Chairperson Ferniza noted this was an information-only item and no presentation would be given.

No public comments.

INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION (ITEM 5 - 8)

5. Federal Fiscal Year 2024 – 2026 ACDBE Triennial Goals

This item was presented by Mr. Michael Hughes and Mr. Donald Mayes. Mr. Hughes began the presentation by introducing Mr. Donald Mayes, the Deputy Director of Phoenix's Equal Opportunity Department (EOD).

Mr. Hughes then described the current triennial goal setting process, and the purpose of having DBE/ACBDE programs. He stated that the airport, as a recipient of federal funding, is required to adhere to regulations concerning DBE/ACBDE contracts.

Mr. Hughes then defined DBE/ACDBE companies in terms of both business ownership and corporate structure.

Mr. Hughes then discussed the Aviation Department's work with the Equal Opportunity Department on the program and turned the presentation over to Mr. Mayes.

Mr. Mayes discussing how goals for the DBE/ACDBE program were established, and the methodology used to determine what goals would be pursued. He noted two goal categories: car rental and non-car rental.

He continued by sharing the goals from the previous triennial period and shared that he expected the current goals to be met and exceeded due to the success at achieving past goals.

Mr. Mayes discussed the methodology behind determining goals for the two categories of ACDBE programs. For non-car rentals, opportunities were measured by areas with potential ACDBE participation, and ACDBE firms that able to perform. For car rental ACDBE goals, other factors like potential participation and current participation were accounted for.

He then discussed the public notice process and timeline given for ACDBE entities to respond to the proposed goals, and he closed by sharing the Federal Aviation Administration approved the proposed goals for Federal Fiscal Year 2024 - 2026.

Ms. Fisker asked why the car rental goal for the upcoming period was reduced when previous goals were met and exceeded.

Mr. Mayes responded that data showed future participation would be lower than past participation.

Ms. Favors added that the data that consultants used to help formulate the goals may have shown there were not as many companies available to participate as in previous years.

Ms. Fisker then asked if Lyft, Uber, Turo and other similar companies affected the lower than expected participation.

Mr. Mayes responded that it was a strong possibility.

Ms. Fisker asked how the Aviation Department would meet its goals if there are no car rental companies in Arizona that qualify as ACDBE.

Mr. Mayes clarified that the available companies include suppliers, such as companies that provide fuel, insurance, and auto repair.

Mr. Makovsky commented that while the presented goals have been reviewed and approved by the FAA, the airport is committed to working to exceed them.

No public comments.

6. Concessions Update

Mr. Richard Graham presented this item. He began by displaying photos of the recently opened concepts in the new Crystals Food Hall in Terminal 4.

Mr. Graham also shared an update on the number of the food and beverage concessions which are open or being re-concepted in both Terminals 3 and 4.

He continued by sharing the menus being offered by each of the two concessionaire primes. He noted that some concepts experienced challenges updating menus or bringing in additional offerings.

Mr. Graham also discussed retail concessionaires and how many are open in both Terminals 3 and 4. He shared that some retail units within Terminal 4 will also be re-concepting.

He also shared that when a concessionaire wishes to re-concept, they need to provide data-driven reasons as to why it should be allowed.

Mr. Graham next discussed passenger services, or lounges. In both terminals lounges are open, and the new Chase Sapphire lounge in Terminal 4 is on-track to open in spring 2024.

He noted that the lounge is incorporating an Airstream RV. Mr. Graham explained that due to its size, windows will be removed from the side of the building allow the Airstream's delivery and installation.

Ms. Pastor asked what will be inside the trailer, and why the company chose an Airstream.

Mr. Graham responded that he did not have details on the interior, its iconic travel history is part of why the Airstream is being installed.

Mr. Graham then discussed the operating hours of food and beverage, retail, and passenger services. He shared Aviation staff have been inspecting the terminals at various times of day to ensure concessionaires are abiding by their contractual operating hours. By conducting random inspections, staff identified that various locations are not abiding by contractual operating hours.

He shared that the findings are being documented and tracked by Aviation staff, and while liquidated damages have not yet been assessed, the documentation is available should liquidated damages be assessed.

Ms. Pastor asked why certain concessionaires are not abiding by contractual hours.

Mr. Graham responded that there were various reasons, but primarily from being short staffed. Aviation notifies management of any infractions.

Ms. Fisker asked for a report as to what "open" means from a contractual standpoint, to better understand how many concessionaires are in total contractual compliance.

Mr. Graham responded that the majority of concessionaires are in complete compliance.

Mr. Alonzo asked how staff determines availability of food for people with dietary restrictions.

Mr. Graham responded that Aviation staff is using the concessionaires' submitted proposals from when the contract was solicited to determine required offerings.

Mr. Alonzo commented that he is getting public feedback that Sky Harbor is a difficult place to eat, especially breakfast, if one has certain dietary restrictions. He would like to see a conversation begin with the concessionaires about offering more options both at sit-down places and grab-n-go places.

Ms. Ferniza commented that future contracts should address dietary restrictions and supported the idea of working with current concessionaires to bring in new dietary restricted items.

Ms. Cherny commented that having concessionaires add items for people with special dietary restrictions would be good for everyone from a revenue perspective.

She also supported the request for greater details on what determines contractual compliance.

Ms. Cherny then commented that if it is late and there is only a single food option available, passengers should be better guided to those locations.

Mr. Cohn commented that a conversation needs to happen with the concessionaires about menu offerings, regardless of what the contract states they will offer. He stated that while the Aviation Department was flexible about contract requirements during COVID, they needed to work with the department on providing dietary restricted food items.

Mr. Graham responded that meetings do occur, and he will make this an agenda item during their next meeting.

No public comments.

7. Sky Harbor Northwest Airfield Redevelopment Update

Mr. Cohn recused himself from this item due to a potential conflict of interest.

Mr. Richard Graham presented this item. He began with a map which displayed the two locations for where air cargo is handled at the airport, west cargo, and south cargo.

He shared how the Comprehensive Asset Management Plan (CAMP) anticipated northwest airfield development, and described the current facilities in that area. He also detailed work to reconstruct Taxiway Alpha to support development.

Mr. Graham then discussed the recent procurement efforts to redevelop the area for cargo purposes, and challenges for potential proposers.

Mr. Graham continued with a map of the area and discussed how the department's new development plan calls for three phases of development, which includes removing current structures and preparing the land for immediate development.

Mr. Graham next displayed several examples of new built cargo facilities at other airports and expressed that the photos depict the direction that Aviation staff want to move towards in the redevelopment of the area.

Ms. Cherny asked what the plans are for the current tenants prior moving forward with development.

Mr. Graham responded that there has been regular communication between Aviation staff and the affected tenants, and they are aware of the impending redevelopment of the corner. Additionally, current lease expiration dates also coincide with the planned developments.

Ms. Cherny asked for the current rent collection amounts.

Mr. Graham responded that he did not have that information at hand but would be happy to supply it.

Ms. Cherny commented that it would be nice to understand what the motivation to redevelop the corner is based on current revenue generated versus potential revenue.

Mr. Graham responded that current cargo operators on site are trying to grow their operations and simply cannot expand due to limited space. Aviation staff are looking at both best use for the space and also potential revenue.

Mr. Makovsky commented that those numbers can be supplied, and that less than 10% of the space in the corner is currently generating revenue. Additionally, many of the current structures on the site are at end of useful life, out of date, or would require substantial improvements to meet current building code.

No public comments.

Mr. Cohn rejoined the meeting.

8. Sustainability Update

Ms. Jennifer Maples presented this item. She began with an overview of how the Aviation Department approaches sustainability and strives to implement sustainable practices into every aspect of airport operations.

Ms. Maples continued by discussing the six focus areas for initiatives and goals set out in the department's Sustainability Management Plan.

She also discussed aviation industry goals to address climate change and how there is an international consensus to achieve net zero carbon by 2050. Sky Harbor has committed to achieving net-zero emissions by 2040, as illustrated by the airport's Level 4 carbon accreditation and other efforts.

Continuing, Ms. Maples discussed the various elements of Sky Harbor's Roadmap to Net Zero Carbon, and current steps being taken to make progress. Along with progress to-date made in reducing carbon emissions, the roadmap outlines what short-term, mid-range, and long-term measures are required to obtain and maintain net zero carbon emissions.

Ms. Maples next discussed several events and initiatives the airport is undertaking to help further sustainability efforts, including citywide sustainability efforts; airport conservation and recycling messaging; the airport's new Green Curb concept for low or no emission rideshare vehicles; as well as Sky Harbor's liquid collection recycling program and water conservation efforts. Aviation has saved 246 million gallons of water since 2014.

No public comments.

ADVISORY BOARD INFORMATION AND FOLLOW-UP REQUESTS

1. Ms. Fisker requested concessionaire details of total compliance of contractual hours and contractual menu offerings.
2. Ms. Cherny requested the current revenue generated from leases on the northwest airfield and the projected revenue from future development.
3. Ms. Ferniza requested additional lease information, including lease expiration dates of those located on the northwest corner of Sky Harbor.

CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Mr. Bryan McCarty made public comment. He shared information about flights over his neighborhood over the past 48 hours, and flight traffic he is experiencing throughout the week.

Mr. McCarty also thanked Aviation staff for their communication and work with Goodyear flight schools. He noted that while he appreciates the efforts made, he feels that it is not enough and requests that special working groups convene to address noise issues.

He continued by providing specific guidelines he would like to see implemented to restrict flight traffic during specific times of day and over certain areas to help reduce noise impacts near his home.

9. Executive Session

A motion to enter executive session was made by Ms. Fisker, seconded by Ms. Pastor.

No public comments.
The motion carried.

ADJOURNMENT

Meeting end at **5:02 p.m.**

PHOENIX AVIATION ADVISORY BOARD REPORT	
To:	Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board
From:	Chad R. Makovsky, A.A.E. Director of Aviation Services
Subject:	Phoenix City Code Revisions to support Peer-to-Peer Car Sharing

Description

This report provides the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board information regarding Phoenix City Code revisions to support peer-to-peer car sharing. The Aviation Department is working to revise Phoenix City Code to establish an operating fee for shared vehicle transactions as authorized under A.R.S. § 28-9614.

THIS ITEM IS FOR INFORMATION ONLY.

Report Summary

On April 9, 2021, Arizona Senate Bill 1720 (SB 1720) was amended to include peer-to-peer car sharing. Per SB 1720, peer-to-peer car sharing means “the authorized use of a shared vehicle by an individual other than the shared vehicle owner through a peer-to-peer car sharing program.”

In 2022, the Aviation Department entered into temporary operating agreements with peer-to-peer operators under a pilot program. During this pilot program period, staff studied peer-to-peer operations at Sky Harbor and learned best practices implemented by other large hub airports where peer-to-peer operations occur.

Based on this information, staff is recommending revisions to Phoenix City Code to continue to allow peer-to-peer car sharing businesses to operate at Sky Harbor. Additionally, the code changes would formally establish an operating fee for shared vehicle transactions and allow Aviation to collect revenue from the operations.

Financial Impact

10% of gross revenue of peer-to-peer shared vehicle transactions.

Location

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport - 2485 E. Buckeye Road

Recommendation

This item is for information only.

PHOENIX AVIATION ADVISORY BOARD	
To:	Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board
From:	Chad R. Makovsky, A.A.E Director of Aviation Services
Subject:	Passenger Experience Benchmarking Survey

Description

This report requests that the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board recommend to the Phoenix City Council to award a contract to KPI North America, LLC for survey work performed by the passenger experience benchmarking surveyor.

THIS ITEM IS FOR CONSENT ACTION.

Report Summary

To help improve the passenger experience, Sky Harbor International Airport relies upon passenger surveys for feedback. These services have been provided by a contractor with technical expertise in developing survey instruments that provide statistically significant results that can inform airport operations and business offerings.

As part of the contract requirements, the passenger experience benchmarking survey company would provide field workers to administer the Airport Council International’s (ACI) passenger survey.

The contractor’s field staff will administer the surveys to passengers as an electronic questionnaire on tablets, and other means as authorized by the Aviation Department. The contractor will be required to tabulate the results of the passengers’ feedback using the ACI Airport Service Quality (ASQ) framework. This proposal also includes the possibility of additional survey work as requested by the airport on an ad-hoc basis.

A Request for Proposal solicitation was posted on June 20, 2023 and resulted in two responsive proposals. The evaluation committee met on September 14, 2023, to conduct a preliminary consensus scoring. KPI North America, LLC is recommended for award of the RFP.

Contract Term

If approved, the five-year contract term will begin on or about January 1, 2024, with no option to extend.

Financial Impact

The total aggregate contract value will not exceed \$600,000 for the five-year contract term. Funds for these services are available in the Aviation Department budget.

Concurrence/Previous Board Action

This item was recommended for approval by the Business and Development Subcommittee November 2, 2023, by a vote of 3-0

Location

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport – 2485 E. Buckeye Road

Recommendation

This report requests that the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board recommend to the Phoenix City Council to contract with KPI North America, LLC. for passenger experience benchmarking surveys.

PHOENIX AVIATION ADVISORY BOARD REPORT	
To:	Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board
From:	Chad R. Makovsky, A.A.E Director of Aviation Services
Subject:	Advertising and Graphic Design Services

Description

This report requests that the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board recommend to the Phoenix City Council to award a contract to Madden Preprint Media, LLC to provide advertising and graphic design services.

THIS ITEM IS FOR CONSENT ACTION.

Report Summary

More than 44 million passengers travel through Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport each year. Communicating with these passengers and the airport’s more than 57,000 employees, and maintaining a world-class customer service experience is foundational to the continued success of the airport.

The purpose of this contract is to secure a vendor to produce quality graphic design materials for the Aviation Department as well as create advertising campaigns for revenue-generating services such as shopping and dining, in addition to placing advertising on social media and online.

Examples of the types of projects the vendor will work on include: The Annual Financial Report, Air Service marketing materials, Aviation Business Summit collateral materials, digital ads for social media channels such as Facebook, including ad purchasing and placement, and other materials promoting airport services such as printed advertisements, posters, or in-airport digital displays.

Procurement Information

A Request for Proposals was published on July 5, 2023. Eight responses were received, and seven were deemed responsive and responsible. An evaluation panel was assembled to review the proposals based on work samples, qualifications of the firm, and the proposed fee schedule.

Award Recommendation

Based on its evaluation, the panel recommended Madden Preprint Media, LLC as the highest scoring proposer for this contract award.

Contract Term

The contract would be for five years, with no options to extend.

Financial Impact

The total aggregate contract value will not exceed \$436,250 over the five-year contract term.

Concurrence/Previous Board Action

This item was recommended for approval by the Business and Development Subcommittee November 2, 2023, by a vote of 3-0

Public Outreach

This Advertising and Graphic Design business opportunity was posted on the City of Phoenix Solicitation website. The announcement was also posted to the Airports Council International North America; American Association of Airport Executives; and AZ Business Gazette websites.

Location

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport - 2485 E. Buckeye Road.

Recommendation

This report requests that the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board recommend to the Phoenix City Council to award a contract for advertising and graphic design services to Madden Preprint Media, LLC.

PHOENIX AVIATION ADVISORY BOARD REPORT	
To:	Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board
From:	Chad R. Makovsky, A.A.E. Director of Aviation Services
Subject:	Airport Custodial & Floor Care Services Contract

Description

This report requests that the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board recommend to the Phoenix City Council to award contracts for Airport Custodial and Floor Care Services at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport, Phoenix Deer Valley Airport, and Phoenix Goodyear Airport.

THIS ITEM IS FOR DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION

Report Summary

On May 31, 2023, Phoenix City Council authorized the issuance of a Request for Proposal (RFP) for Airport Custodial & Floor Care Services.

RFP 23-032 was issued on June 16, 2023. The Aviation Department created two large and one small company contract opportunities to provide labor, equipment, supervision, and method of communication necessary to support effective custodial services and floor care services at all three airports and related Aviation office spaces. Each contract opportunity will include an Employee Retention Policy, which will require the successful Offeror to retain current custodial services contract employees and retain those employees for at least 90 days to ensure the provision of uninterrupted services.

- Group A – Large Company Custodial Services
- Group B – Small Company Custodial Services
- Group C – Floor Care Services (Large Company)

Proposals were evaluated by a four-member evaluation committee based on the following five criteria:

- 1. Operations Plan (0-300 Points)
- 2. Qualifications/Experience (0-225 Points)
- 3. Quality Assurance and Work Order Management Program (0-200 Points)
- 4. Recruitment and Retention Plan (0-175 Points)
- 5. Pricing (0-100 Points)

Procurement Information

Group A: Six proposals were received. All proposals were deemed responsive and responsible.

The evaluation panel recommends award to ABM Aviation, Inc. based on the following consensus scoring:

- ABM Aviation, Inc. 855.23 Points

- Flagship Airport Services, Inc. 725.25 Points
- JanCo FS 3, LLC d/b/a Velociti Services 709.47 Points
- Pritchard Industries, LLC 700.40 Points
- UBM Enterprise, Inc. 630.00 Points
- United Maintenance Company, Inc. 513.75 Points

Group B: Eight proposals were received. One proposal was deemed non-responsive.

The evaluation panel recommends award to 3H & 3H, Inc. based on the following consensus scoring:

- 3H & 3H, Inc. 841.26 Points
- Commercial Custodial Services 755.00 Points
- Clearly Clean Janitorial Services, LLC 717.04 Points
- Bio Janitorial Services, Inc. 706.49 Points
- Landmark Building Maintenance Services LLC
d/b/a Pivot Building Services 635.26 Points
- Trooper USA, LLC 625.56 Points
- National Maintenance Group, LLC 543.99 Points

Group C: Four proposals were received. One proposal was deemed non-responsive.

The evaluation panel recommends award to JanCCo FS 3, d/b/a Velociti Service based on the following consensus scoring:

- JanCo FS 3, LLC d/b/a Velociti Services 788.23 Points
- ABM Aviation, Inc. 772.18 Points
- Flagship Airport Services, Inc. 715.00 Points

Contract Term

The initial five-year contract terms for all 3 Groups will begin on or about April 1, 2024. Contract provisions include two, one-year renewal options which may be exercised at the sole discretion of the Aviation Director, for a seven-year total contract term.

Financial Impact

The total estimated combined contract value will be up to \$32,000,000 over a seven-year aggregate contract term.

Concurrence/Previous Board Action

This item was recommended for approval by the Business and Development Subcommittee November 2, 2023, by a vote of 3-0

Public Outreach

This Airport Custodial & Floor Care Services business opportunity was posted on the City of Phoenix Solicitation website. The announcement was also sent to more than 1,600 firms who have registered with the City of Phoenix vendor management system,

ProcurePHX. A pre-proposal meeting with two site tours were held on June 26, 2023, through June 28, 2023.

Location

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport, 2485 E. Sky Harbor Blvd
Phoenix Deer Valley Airport, 702 W. Deer Valley Road
Goodyear Airport, 1658 S. Litchfield Road, Goodyear, AZ

Recommendation

This report requests that the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board recommend to the Phoenix City Council to award contracts for Airport Custodial and Floor Care Services to ABM Aviation, Inc. for Group A, 3H & 3H, Inc for Group B, and JanCCo FS 3, d/b/a Velociti Service for Group C.

PHOENIX AVIATION ADVISORY BOARD REPORT	
To:	Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board
From:	Chad R. Makovsky, A.A.E. Director of Aviation Services
Subject:	Strategic Plan Update

Description

This report provides the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board an update on the Aviation Department’s strategic planning process.

THIS ITEM IS FOR INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION.

Report Summary

In October 2022, the Aviation Department initiated a new strategic planning process. In collaboration with Exambela Consulting, an internal steering committee completed a months-long research process, involving outreach to a variety of stakeholders and employees.

The focus of the plan was to provide direction and focus to the department over a five-year timespan, focusing on key areas for business growth, employee development and community engagement.

Staff will provide a summary of the information gathered during the strategic planning process and the current implementation process.

Location

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport - 2485 E. Buckeye Road

Recommendation

This item is for information and discussion.

PHOENIX AVIATION ADVISORY BOARD REPORT	
To:	Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board
From:	Chad R. Makovsky, A.A.E. Director of Aviation Services
Subject:	Concessions Update

Description

This report provides the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board with an update on concession program activity at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport.

THIS ITEM IS FOR INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION.

Report Summary

Through the Aviation Department, the City manages several lines of airport business, associated revenues, expenses, and maintains credit to support financing the capital investments of a large-hub commercial airport.

As of November 2023, terminal passenger services, retail, and food and beverage concessions are 96% open. An open concession is defined as staffed and fully operational based on hours set forth by the Aviation Department. The 4% of concessions not open is due to the concession location undergoing re-concept construction. See Attachment A for listing of each concession location operating hours set by Aviation Department.

As identified within their respective contracts, certain Prime concessionaires are required to provide food and beverage outlet locations that are staffed 24-hours in the pre- and post-security areas. The remaining concourse food and beverage as well as retail locations are required to have at a minimum one outlet open for first flight and last flight departures for each Prime concessionaire. All other units on each concourse are required to operate a minimum of 6 a.m. to 10 p.m. daily.

Additionally, all concessionaires have been asked to post the standard opening and closing hours at the entrance of each store to provide customers with clear information about the store operating hours. These operating hours will also be reflected on the skyharbor.com website to enhance customer experience and ensure consistency.

The Airport Concessions team continues to monitor the operational hours and track non-compliant tenants by conducting random unannounced walks at various times and dates of the week. From time-to-time Concessionaires are observed to not be operating within the operational hours set by Aviation Department, and in those cases are assessed liquidated damages when Aviation staff identify noncompliance.

The Airport Concessions team worked with the food and beverage concessionaires to restore menu offerings to 2019 levels. These include providing the traveling public with a variety of food offering options, kids' menus, and alternative diet options. Menus for concessionaires offer kid-friendly menus and dietary-restricted items as well as

designated markings to encourage customers to speak with the server about additional dietary accommodations or menu alternatives. The Airport Concessions team continues to work with the Public Relations and Technology to identify and resolve issues with the search engine functionality on the skyharbor.com website to ensure alternative diet options are fully searchable within the website. Additionally, these staff teams are also working to ensure that links to menus are fully available, and restaurants are searchable by dietary needs on the website.

Location

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport – 2485 E. Buckeye Road

PHOENIX AVIATION ADVISORY BOARD REPORT	
To:	Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board
From:	Chad R. Makovsky, A.A.E. Director of Aviation Services
Subject:	Triennial Emergency Exercise Update

Description

This report provides the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board with an update on the 2023 Triennial Emergency Exercise at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport.

THIS ITEM IS FOR INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION.

Report Summary

The Aviation Department conducted its 2023 Triennial Emergency Exercise on Wednesday, October 25 at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport. The exercise was designed to test emergency response capabilities for a simulated aircraft accident on the airfield. More than 400 participants supported the exercise, including more than 150 volunteers who roleplayed as passengers and family members.

This multi-agency exercise included support from Fire units with Tempe, Mesa and Scottsdale and the activation of trauma centers in local hospitals. Unique exercise elements included the fact that it occurred after sunset, and it involved the deployment of a Fire Department drone over the event site on airport property thanks to close coordination with the Federal Aviation Administration.

This report provides an overview of the Triennial Exercise’s primary elements, and lessons learned throughout the event.

Location

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport - 2485 E. Buckeye Road.

Recommendation

This item is for information and discussion.